

Community College District

# Full-Time Faculty Recruitment & Selection Procedures

**Human Resources Department** 

EDITION March 30, 2020

# Full-Time Faculty Recruitment & Selection Procedures Administrative Procedure 7120

# Section 1: Recruitment Approval

- Contact the Administrative Services office at the college or the Human Resources Specialist Recruitment (HR Specialist) to initiate a requisition for approval to conduct a recruitment for an open position.
- 2. Return forms to the Administrative Services office who will process at the college level and forward to Human Resources to obtain approval through the Executive Management Team (EMT).

# SECTION 2: Establish Committee, Designate Committee Chair, and Responsibilities

#### A. Designate a Search Committee Chair

Once the EMT approves the positions, the department chair and the dean/vice president, in consultation with department members, shall appoint a search committee chair to coordinate and facilitate the recruitment. The search committee chair should be a full-time faculty member who has previously participated on a search committee, and who possesses the knowledge, skill and time to effectively lead a proper recruitment.

#### B. Establish Committee

- 1. The committee members are selected by the department chair in consultation with the Dean and with the notification to, and chance to object by, the full-time faculty members in the department. If an objection is raised, the department chair shall provide a written response.
- 2. There shall be a minimum of five committee members with full-time tenured or non-tenured faculty in the majority.
- 3. The committee shall include faculty members with minimum qualifications in the discipline being sought to ensure subject competence. If no faculty members with minimum qualifications in the discipline are available to serve on the committee, every effort should be made to include faculty members with expertise in related fields. Non-subject matter faculty members, administrators, students and classified employees may serve on the committee. The committee may also include professionals or others outside of the District who can contribute expertise to the selection process subject to notification to, and chance to object by, the Academic Senate. If an objection is raised, the Vice President shall provide a written response.
- 4. The committee is strongly encouraged to include students in the process. The role and depth of student involvement will be defined by the committee at the beginning of the process.
- 5. Faculty members may <u>not</u> serve on a search committee until after their first year, and whenever possible, until the successful conclusion of their probationary period (tenure). Those who have given notice of resignation or retirement may generally not serve on a search committee.
- 6. To the extent possible, the committee will reflect diversity and inclusiveness, which includes, but is not limited to, such qualities as gender, race, ethnicity, age, disability, sexual orientation, and perspective.
- 7. It is expected that committee members will participate in the recruitment and selection process from the beginning to the end. In some cases, however, this is not possible. In order to ensure fairness to the applicants, a committee member's ratings / scores can only be counted if he / she completes an entire paper screening and interview process. This means that if a committee member screens or interviews only a portion of the applicants, none of their ratings / scores can be counted. Another example is when a committee member has a conflict with one of the candidates on the day of the interview and says, "I can't participate in this interview but I will

- evaluate the other candidates." The committee member must excuse him/herself from the entire screening process.
- 8. Committee members may be substituted during the process as long as it is acceptable to the committee and to Human Resources; and that diversity and inclusiveness are maintained as noted above. If the composition of the committee is changed (resignations, etc.), the committee must be recertified by the Academic Senate, appropriate Vice President, and the Human Resources Department.
- 9. The committee must be approved by the Academic Senate.

#### C. Submit Committee Membership Form

When the committee has been identified, complete the Committee Membership form and submit it to the Academic Senate for review and recommendation for approval. The Academic Senate President shall sign, indicating the Academic Senate's recommendation of the proposed committee membership.

After sending the membership form to the Academic Senate, submit to the appropriate Vice President for review and approval.

Once approved by the Vice President, submit to Human Resources for review and approval. The Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, or designee, shall review the proposed membership and may require changes to the committee composition to ensure diversity and inclusiveness.

# A position will <u>NOT</u> be posted for recruitment until the committee membership has been established and approved by HR.

# D. Committee Member Responsibilities:

- 1. Recruit, screen and identify a minimum goal of 3-5 finalist candidates to recommend to the hiring authority for consideration. In certain circumstances and in consultation with Human Resources, a recommendation of only two finalists may be acceptable.
- 2. Demonstrate objectivity, fairness, and equality of treatment of all applicants.
- 3. Commitment to the process.
- 4. Maintain the integrity of the process.
- 5. Ensure confidentiality of the process, which means no discussion outside of the committee to include, but not be limited to, releasing the names of applicants, numbers of applicants or finalists, where the applicants work, their degrees, etc. There will be no side discussions of applicants and their qualifications outside of a full committee's meeting. What occurs in the selection process stays within the committee before, during and after the selection has been made. The exception to this regulation is when a committee member or step in the process is not being followed appropriately or the process has been compromised. If this is the case, contact the Human Resources Department immediately for guidance.
- 6. Work collaboratively to form the job announcement, to write supplemental questions, and to decide how the candidates shall be evaluated.
- 7. Determine the desired qualifications for the position that will ensure the candidate's successfulness.
- 8. Submit names of professional organizations, web sites, publications and journals specific to the position for advertising purposes-
- 9. Develop the supplemental questions to be used in the application screening process, develop the screening form, develop the interview questions, and develop the rating mechanism ensuring that all of the above are job-related specifically to the position and are so noted in the job announcement.

- 10. Use the established forms for application screening and interviewing; maintaining notes on the established forms; if additional sheets are used to record notes, they are to be attached to the actual forms.
- 11. Participate in both the paper screening and interviewing of the candidates.
- 12. Sign all rating forms and total scores to ensure accuracy.
- 13. Do not copy or remove applicant's application documents, paper screening or interview forms for personal or other use.
- 14. Report procedural errors to the committee chair.
- 15. Submit all documents used in the selection process to the committee chair.
- 16. Make no contacts with applicants unless authorized by the committee chair and approved by Human Resources.

#### E. Committee Chair Responsibilities:

- 1. Provide active leadership in the steps of the selection process (application screening, interviews and reference checking)
- 2. Keep all recruitment and selection documents in a secure location during <del>paper</del> screening and between interviews
- 3. Organize and manage committee's operation
- 4. Ensure the steps of the process are followed
- 5. Notify the Human Resources Department of procedural errors and to request guidance and direction
- 6. Submit of all documents used in the selection process to Human Resources
- 7. Coordinate interviews to include dates, times, and location
- 8. Work closely with the college Administrative Services office and the Human Resources Specialist Recruitment

# F. Training

All faculty, staff and administrators involved in hiring must receive training on equity, diversity, and the employment process. Training is provided by Human Resources, and additional training may be requested by the search committee chair or hiring manager. It is the responsibility of the search committee chair to ensure that each committee member receives the required training. As part of the training, Human Resources or the committee chair will provide each committee member with a copy of this procedure with a cover memo in substantially the following form:

Thank you for your interest and willingness to participate in the recruitment and selection process. Those persons involved in the selection of new faculty are agents of the Board of Trustees empowered to help select the best candidates. Because you are an agent of the Governing Board, you will be held accountable for every aspect of the process. Your participation is an investment of your time, knowledge and skills. You have the professional responsibility to follow all policies and procedures. These procedures have been established to promote equity and guard against litigation. As long as you follow these procedures, the District will defend committee members should litigation result.

In addition, each committee member will be expected to sign a confidentiality form, acknowledging the completion of required EEO training and expectations of confidentiality.

#### **SECTION 3: Determine a Search Timeline**

Use the Recruitment Timeline Planning Worksheet to develop a search timeline. Work with the HR Specialist – Recruitment to identify major milestones such as posting length, completion of application review, first-level interviews, and finalist interviews. Review the search timeline with the committee and ask members to schedule committee time commitments in their calendars.

Sign and submit a copy of the search timeline to Human Resources.

A position will <u>NOT</u> be posted for recruitment until the search timeline has been established and submitted to Human Resources.

# **SECTION 4: Prepare Job Announcement**

# Administrative Services office:

- 1. The college Administrative Services office representative will provide the committee with a job announcement template. If available, the previous job announcement will also be provided.
- 2. The college Administrative Services office representative will also provide each committee member with a copy of these procedures.

# Committee: All hiring committee members will work collaboratively to:

- 1. Develop the job assignment (subjects to be taught or specific assignment, etc.)
- 2. Review the minimum qualifications to ensure accuracy and conformance with the established Statewide and District Minimum Qualifications List; the minimum qualifications cannot be changed at this stage of the process.
- 3. Identify any desirable qualifications. Although the committee you may develop desirable qualifications, the committee is cautioned because these are generally used to exclude applicants from consideration, and so are carefully scrutinized. The State Chancellor's Office and Title 5 encourages community colleges to advertise positions based on minimum qualifications to become more inclusive rather than exclusive. If desirable qualifications are included in the job announcement, the Human Resources Department is required to develop historical data on the impact of the desirable qualifications in the initial recruitment, the minimum qualifications, the application screening, the interview, finalists and selection pools. If the desirable qualifications are determined to have an adverse impact on under-represented groups, the use of desirable qualifications will be discontinued as directed by the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources.
- 4. Development of supplemental questions is not required but may be included as a requirement in the application process. All applicants will be asked to provide a diversity statement that demonstrates their understanding and sensitivity to diverse backgrounds of community college students.
- 5. The job description (Board and Union approved) will be included in the job announcement; the committee may make minor changes to the description as a result of changes in job titles mentioned within the description, etc. If in doubt, contact the HR Specialist.
- 6. The committee may not change other elements of the job announcement, such as salary and benefits, and selection process. The committee may, however, make suggestions to Human Resources to improve the information provided to the public.
- 7. Return the draft to Human Resources.

# **SECTION 5: Recruitment Advertising**

Human Resources will post the job announcement in several publications and job boards, such as the California Community College Registry, HigherEdJobs.com, etc. A full list of the current standard job posting boards can be provided to the committee upon request.

The committee should develop a recruitment, advertising, and outreach plan. This could include: (1) identifying additional publications or job boards specific to the position's profession; (2) identifying professional listservs to announce the job opening; (3) identifying any professional gatherings or conferences to attend and recruit; (4) identifying colleagues from whom to seek nominations/recommendations; and (5) any other ideas for identifying and recruiting a diverse applicant pool.

Please note that some publications may require a month or more notice or they only publish every other month so we will not, in some cases, be able to meet the deadlines.

Ads in publications usually appear once. Depending on the cost, Human Resources may pay for more than one advertisement. Additional publication dates can be included, provided the expense is borne by the college / division / department.

The Human Resources Department is tracking the information provided by applicants on where they heard about the position. This information will be used in the future to determine the success rates of the best publications for reaching different job categories.

If committee members are expecting to attend conferences or workshops and committee members would like application materials to take with them, contact the Human Resources Specialist - Recruitment. Please give the staff a minimum of three weeks for preparation.

Committees may not prepare their own job announcements or advertisements for positions, but are encouraged to provide suggestions and material to Human Resources.

#### **SECTION 6: Develop Screening Criteria**

The purpose of the application screening form is to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities of the applicants to determine those who best meet the job-related criteria and desirable qualifications, if any, included in the job announcement to warrant a personal interview with the committee. To accomplish this, the committee must develop screening criteria and weight each criteria. The screening criteria must be based on information committee members can obtain from the application materials.

The Statewide Academic Senate recommends that all faculty be assessed on the following: subject matter knowledge and competency, teaching and communication skills, commitment to professional growth and service, and potential for overall college effectiveness. These attributes should be considered when developing the committee's supplemental questions. The Education Code and Title 5 also requires that each applicant demonstrate their sensitivity to and understanding of the diverse academic, socioeconomic, cultural, disability, and ethnic backgrounds of the District's students.

# A. Developing Screening Criteria

To ensure that all committee members understand how and what to evaluate and to ensure consistency among the committee in the screening process, the committee will establish standard screening criteria pertinent to the position. If the committee asked the candidates to complete supplemental questions, these must also be included in the screening criteria. The following are examples that can be modified to meet other non-teaching faculty assignments:

- 1. Preparation to teach pre-associate degree through transfer level courses (as demonstrated in breadth / depth in coursework, research, other skills or job-related experiences)
- 2. Exposure to teaching techniques (as demonstrated in educational courses, experience, workshops, internships, tutoring or other preparation)
- 3. Written communication skills (as demonstrated in presentation of application materials)
- 4. Knowledge of multiple teaching methods (as demonstrated by exposure to teaching techniques through educational courses, experience, workshops, or other preparation)
- 5. Sensitivity to diverse academic, socioeconomic, cultural, disability, and ethnic backgrounds of community college students (as demonstrated in experience, application explanation and other documents)
- 6. Participation in co-curricular / professional growth activities to enhance the classroom learning experience (as demonstrated in student activities, professional groups, extra-curricular activities, travel, professional organizations or published works)
- 7. Involvement in other activities to promote, encourage and deliver instruction using methodologies in addition to lecture, such as online education (as demonstrated in experience and application materials)

The committee may not evaluate the candidates on where they obtained their education, on the number of degrees they possess, and how many years of experience they possess as none of these are proven examples of competency. Any strength(s) of the candidates regarding the measurement of desirable qualifications can be addressed in the above paper screening criteria.

Once the committee has determined the screening criteria, it should determine the weights for each criteria. The weights are a percentage, and so the weights should add up to 100. Each criterion will be scored on a scale of 0-5, with 0 being lowest possible and 5 being highest possible score. The committee may assign weights evenly across the criteria; or may want to assign more weight to one or more screening criteria. For example, the committee may want to have more emphasis on "preparation to teach pre-associate degree through transfer level courses" than "written communication skills. Keep in mind that all of the screening criteria are important when selecting a faculty member who will be successful, including the sensitivity criteria.

The committee should submit materials to the college Administrative Services office representative who will review criteria with the Vice President and then forward to the Human Resources Department.

#### B. Final Approval

The Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources or designee will have final approval of the screening criteria. The Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, or designee, may modify or delete selection criteria, which may reflect bias, or have a disparate impact on a group of candidates. For example, if the criterion is "possesses community college experience," this will be deleted. No analysis has been completed to determine that prior community college experience is a predictor of an excellent teacher. Nor has it been determined that the criteria does not have an adverse impact on the underrepresented, women, and the disabled.

The committee may not revise the screening criteria after submission to Human Resources. If there is a problem, contact the Human Resources Department for assistance.

A position will <u>NOT</u> be posted for recruitment until the screening criteria has been established and approved by HR.

# SECTION 7: Develop Interview Criteria, Questions, Teaching Demonstration and Rating Mechanism

# A. Interview Preparation

There are several business items the committee must decide upon prior to the actual interviews, which may have an impact on developing the interview criteria and deciding on the teaching demonstration.

- 1. <u>Tardiness of candidates</u>: The committee members must decide if they are going to accept the late candidate for an interview at the time he/she arrives or later in the day, another day or not at all. The committee is encouraged to ask for a reason for the tardiness because it may be a legitimate reason, such as a freeway traffic accident. The committee is encouraged to accommodate the candidates with legitimate reasons as a "zero tolerance" approach limits the applicant pool. Be consistent in the treatment of all candidates.
- Location and equipment: Give considerable thought to, the location of the interviews to ensure
  there is adequate space to give the teaching demonstration. Ensure that appropriate
  equipment/resources are available in the location such as chalk board, laptop, overhead projector,
  etc.
- 3. <u>First and finalists interviews dates</u>: Plan tentative dates with all committee members present to ensure a timely process. Allow time for the review process by the Vice President and Human Resources to occur plus ten days notification to the candidates to make arrangements to participate in the interviews. Be flexible as we want to hire the best candidate for the position. The District may lose an excellent candidate because we are trying to make an internal deadline.

# B. Developing Interview Criteria and Interview Questions

Based on the same criteria as noted above under application screening, the committee should develop specific interview criteria and the questions to assess the candidate's ability to meet the criteria. The interview criteria are the bold statements that indicate the committee's focus is to select the best qualified candidate for the job. The interview criteria must be comprehensive and cover all characteristics and knowledge that we expect a faculty member to possess. The following are criteria suggestions that may be modified to fit the specific faculty position. The college Administrative Services office representative or HR Specialist - Recruitment may be able to provide the committee with an example of interview criteria and questions.)

- 1. Knowledge and background preparation to teach the subject matter
- 2. Knowledge of multiple teaching methods to include critical teaching skills
- 3. Problem-solving skills in a teaching / learning environment
- 4. Commitment to a positive learning environment and an enthusiastic belief and attitude towards the encouragement of learning
- 5. Sensitivity to diversity (academic, cultural, ethnic, socioeconomic and the disabled) \*
- 6. Willingness to take initiative in co-curricular activities, special events, shared governance, and participation in department / division activities
- 7. Interpersonal skills and mutual respect to be effective with students and staff
- 8. Verbal communication skills
- 9. Written communication skills

Once the interview criteria are developed, the committee develops the interview questions (one or more) for each of the interview criterion to assess each candidate's knowledge, skills, and abilities. This is very important because this keeps the committee members focused on the reason for the question so they do not evaluate, for example, problem-solving skills when the question focuses on knowledge of multiple

teaching methods. The committee members should discuss the appropriate answers to the questions to ensure everyone is focused on the expected responses.

\* The Human Resources Department has developed some interview questions to assist the committee in assessing the interview criterion. The Education Code and Title 5 requires that meaningful consideration be given to which applicants fully demonstrate their sensitivity and understanding. Merely having experience working with diversity does not demonstrate specific sensitivity and understanding.

# C. Developing Follow-up Questions

Sometimes in interviews individual committee members have a desire to ask questions to obtain additional information not covered in the pre-approved interview questions or to ask follow-up questions based on a particular answer. Although it is not illegal to do so, this practice could be perceived by other committee members as trying to embarrass or promote one candidate over another candidate by obtaining additional information. The committee is, therefore, encouraged to develop follow-up questions in advance and include them in the interview questions. For example, the committee may ask the question, "Describe the teaching methods you will use in the classroom to ensure that all academic levels are being served effectively." Examples of follow-up questions, might include: "Why did you select these specific teaching methods?"; "How do you assure that student outcomes to these teaching methods are successful?"; "Have you tried other teaching methods?"

Developing follow-up questions requires the committee to answer the questions themselves to ensure the question is effective and the answer is what the committee is looking for in a response.

# D. Developing the Teaching / Counseling / Librarian Demonstration and Evaluation Criteria

After the interview criteria and interview questions are developed, the committee's next step is to determine the teaching / counseling / librarian or other faculty demonstration to be assessed in the interview. The committee is encouraged to require a minimum of a ten-minute topic that will represent the applicant's depth and understanding of the subject matter and teaching methods. The goal is to provide the committee with enough information to assess the following suggested evaluation criteria:

- Candidate followed directions in preparing for demonstration
- Content and knowledge pertinent to the position
- Effective student / faculty interaction
- Presentation enthusiastic and interesting
- Candidate was well prepared
- Handouts were appropriate to the presentation

# E. Developing the Rating Mechanism

After the interview criteria, interview questions, teaching demonstration and evaluation criteria are completed, the next and final step is to determine the rating mechanism, such as a scale from 0 to 5 with 5 being the highest possible score or 0-10 with 10 being the highest. The committee may also want to give more weight to one or more interview criteria. For example, the committee may emphasize on "knowledge of multiple teaching methods to include critical teaching skills" instead of "willingness to take initiative in co-curricular activities..." Keep in mind that all of the above are equally important when selecting a faculty member who will be successful, including the sensitivity criteria. After the committee has developed the rating mechanism and any weighting, review the ratings, in totality, should be reviewed to ensure that the committee is satisfied with the outcome. Caution: Sometimes weighting may result in the teaching demonstration having more emphasis than the oral interview. In the case of physical

education positions with two demonstrations, one teaching and one coaching, it is easy to inadvertently place more weight on the demonstrations than the oral interview.

#### F. Submission of Documents

The committee must then submit a typed or emailed document to include the interview criteria, the specific questions to address the criteria, teaching demonstration evaluation and criteria, and rating mechanism to Human Resources. The responsible Vice President shall review and approve the document.

The form must include a place for the candidate's name, plenty of room to take interview notes, a line for each question score, the total score, a place for the rater's signature, and date. (A document of just the questions, without the evaluators' information should also be created.) The following is an example:

Criteria: Knowledge and background preparation to teach the subject matter

## **Sample Questions:**

1.	Please describe how your background and experience has prepared you to teach	Rate 0-5
2.	What have you done recently to keep current in your field?	Rate 0-5

The last question of the interview should include the opportunity for the candidate to ask questions about the position. This question is unrated.

Applications will <u>NOT</u> be released to the search committee until interview criteria and interview questions have been submitted to the Human Resources Department for review and approval. The Human Resources Department will have final approval of the interview criteria and questions. The Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, or designee, may modify or delete interview criteria or questions that may reflect a bias or have a disparate impact on a group of candidates.

The committee may not revise the interview criteria, interview questions, etc., after submission to Human Resources. If there is a problem, contact the Human Resources Department for assistance.

# **SECTION 8: Human Resources Review of Initial Applicant Pool and Minimum Qualifications**

When the recruitment has closed, Human Resources will analyze the initial pool of applicants to determine if the applicant pool meets the expected diverse representation as required by Title 5. This could be a factor that would require the recruitment for the position to be extended for further outreach. If, the applicant pool meets or exceeds the expected representation, then the selection process may move forward. The recruitment may also be extended due to an inadequate number of applicants based on employment trends. The Human Resources Department will also analyze the recruitment plan.

If the initial pool meets the expected representation, the Human Resources Department will screen the applications to determine if the candidates meet minimum qualifications and identify those who do not meet the minimum but may qualify for an equivalency. Human Resources will release all applications

meeting the minimum qualifications and those who may qualify for an equivalency to the committee. It is the committee's responsibility to screen all applications provided for screening. Every committee member must enter application review evaluative scores in the online system, for each application.

# **SECTION 9: Equivalency**

If there are any candidates who require an equivalency review, the application review process cannot be finished until the Equivalency Committee reviews the equivalency requests. The Equivalency Committee is flexible and expects to meet on a regular basis during recruitment periods to avoid delays.

After the equivalency process is completed, those candidates meeting equivalency will be forwarded to the committee for application screening.

The Human Resources Department will complete any documentation necessary and notify the committee chair that the application review may be finished.

#### **SECTION 10: Committee Application Review**

#### A. Begin the Application Review

The committee may not revise the screening form after submission to Human Resources. It is not the committee's responsibility to re-determine if an applicant meets minimum or equivalent qualifications. If there is a problem, contact the Human Resources Department for assistance.

Each committee member will screen each applicant. There are exceptions to this rule and they are:

- The committee member becomes ill and cannot participate in order to meet the selection timeline
  of the committee.
- One of the committee members is a student or someone outside the District and cannot meet the selection timeline of the committee.

The committee must agree to the exceptions. Any exceptions must be noted when submitting the paper screening paperwork.

If the applicant pool is small, the committee may agree to bypass the screening process and interview all applicants. If this is the case, the committee chair should notify the HR Specialist - Recruitment. When an applicant pool is seven applications or less, it is required to skip the application screening process and invite all applicants for an interview (when the recruitment is for two or more openings, then any applicant pool of 12 applications or less is required to skip the application screening process). The committee members should attempt to review each application prior to the interview day.

#### B. Conflict of Interest

If, during the screening process, a committee member has a conflict of interest with one of the applicants, the committee member must excuse him/herself from the committee. The committee member may no longer participate in the selection process. It is not acceptable for the committee member to screen all other applicants and excuse him / herself from paper screening the one applicant for which the committee member has a conflict. If this occurs, the paper screening process has been compromised. The committee member may be replaced.

A conflict of interest is created when the committee member recognizes by verbal notification or in the screening process that an applicant is a family member or close friend, which compromises the committee

member in making an unbiased decision in the selection process. A conflict also occurs when a committee member knows significant negative information about an applicant that impairs his/her objectivity to assess the applicant fairly. The committee member must notify the committee chair immediately. The committee chair should consult Human Resources in determining the appropriate course of action.

Note: It is inappropriate to share any information (negative or positive) a committee member may know or think he or she knows about a candidate. Instead, the committee member should inform Human Resources. The reference check process is the appropriate means to validate the character and work ethic of the candidates.

# C. Screening Deliberation Process

The committee chair will share the results of the composite committee rankings with the committee. The committee members will discuss the applicants as related to the pre-approved screening criteria.

The deliberation process has the potential to include other appropriate discussions that are taken into consideration in the decision making process. The following are examples of inappropriate matters that should be avoided:

# **Avoid discussions concerning:**

- Additional paper screening criteria not included in the pre-approved form
- Discussions of any protected characteristic, such as race, gender, age, sexual orientation, and disability
- Personal bias
- Information committee members have heard or know about an applicant
- An applicant's responses to the general questions on the application form

Be responsible and if in doubt about a topic of discussion, do not discuss it.

During the deliberation process, the committee members must decide, based on the composite scores of the applicants, how many will be invited to an interview. The composite scores will give a clear picture of how many to invite. Instead of limiting invitees, be more inclusive for the following reasons:

- The committee is screening based on the presentation of their materials; this is not a true reflection of the applicant's knowledge, skills and abilities.
- The applicant may not have personally completed the application documents; there are agencies
  offering this service for a fee.
- The committee is screening based on how much education and experience they have and more does not necessarily mean better.
- The District will likely lose candidates when we schedule the interviews and after we have scheduled the interviews.
- The goal is to find the best qualified person; take the time and be more inclusive and interview as many applicants as possible.
- Being more inclusive is evidence that the committee is making a good faith effort to be more inclusive in response to the District's equal opportunity employment commitment and to meet Title 5 requirements.

The deliberation process will be reviewed by the appropriate Vice President and the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources to ensure that the process was conducted in an inappropriate manner. For example, if the committee paper screens 30 applicants and only offers five interviews, this is suspect. This may indicate a hidden agenda, which must be reviewed. In reality, if 30 people meet the minimum

qualifications, the committee should be inviting more than five candidates. Furthermore, inviting only five may result in fewer actually accepting the District's invitation, limiting the candidate pool. Finally, forwarding three to five finalists for second level interviews is preferred, and if the committee starts with less than five candidates, the chances of ensuring such an outcome are significantly reduced.

In the above scenario, the Vice President or the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources may require that the committee interview more than five candidates in an effort to ensure equal opportunity employment and to ensure the committee is making a concerted effort to employ the best qualified person. Furthermore, if the process is compromised in any way, the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources has the authority of the Chancellor to stop the process at any time.

Any decision by the Vice President and the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources does not negate the hard work of the committee, but it is the responsibility of everyone to ensure our selection processes support equal employment opportunity and fairness to all applicants. It is everyone's objective to employ the best qualified person for the position.

<u>Important Note</u>: The committee members may not reproduce the submissions of any applicants. These documents are confidential District Office records, not committee member records or college records.

# **SECTION 11: Scheduling Interviews**

It is the responsibility of the committee chair to:

- coordinate the dates, times and location of the interviews in consultation with the committee.
  - Local candidates shall be given at least five-day advance notice to participate in an interview.
  - Out-of-state candidates must be given a ten days advance notice in order to make transportation arrangements to participate in the interview. So, plan ahead and be as accommodating as possible. Candidates invited to the first interview are responsible for their own expenses.
  - As an alternative to travel, the committee is encouraged to offer out-of-state, or long distance, candidates a video interview.

In addition, the committee chair will:

- arrange for contacting the candidates; send a confirmation to the candidates, which should include interview date, time, location, teaching demonstration, a map and a parking permit;
- include any information pertinent to the teaching demonstration that the candidates may request, such as equipment needed for the teaching demonstration;
- prepare a clean copy of the interview questions without selection criteria and rating mechanism for the candidates to review on the day of the interviews;
- arrange for a contact person to whom the candidates should report;
- assure the contact person is knowledgeable of his/her responsibilities; and
- assure the process is followed consistently for all candidates.

Committee members should assist the committee chair whenever possible.

<u>Important</u> Note: No special interviews for out-of-state candidates to avoid returning for a second interview are allowed, as it may create a perception of bias.

# **SECTION 12: Interview Day**

The hiring process involves the evaluation of people for a position. At the same time, the candidates are evaluating whether they want to work at the West Valley-Mission Community College District.

The committee's goal is to present the District in such a way that all candidates exposed to the process go away feeling that West Valley-Mission Community College District is the only institution with which they want to work. This principle, of course, applies to every stage of the hiring procedures, but nowhere is it more relevant than in the interview process, when the candidates and the committee, representing the institution, come face-to-face.

The committee should strive to make the interview process humane and to create a relaxed atmosphere conducive to the candidate's doing his or her best.

#### A. Welcome and Information

When the candidate arrives for the interview and reports to the contact person, he/she is to be given 5 to 10 minutes to preview the interview questions, which <u>must not include the selection criteria or rating mechanism</u>. Whatever the time limit the committee determines, it must be consistently applied to every candidate. If the candidate makes notes and brings them into the interview from this brief review, don't be alarmed. The person is probably jotting notes to remember during the interview. What is not acceptable is for the candidate to bring a brief case of documentation or a mobile device to review after every question is asked. If this occurs, the committee chair should be kind and tell the candidate that the committee prefers responses to the questions directly from the candidate without reference to other documents. This should resolve the problem and not impede the process.

<u>Important Note</u>: Sometimes candidates bring letters of reference, student evaluations of their teaching ability or other documentation to leave with the committee at the time of the interview. The committee chair is to thank the candidate for providing the information. This information is <u>not</u> to be reviewed by the committee members, nor can any of the information be taken into consideration as part of the evaluation of the candidate. The committee chair is to keep this information in his/her possession to be returned to Human Resources with a note of explanation.

#### B. Committee Interview

All candidates are on a level-playing field, meaning no consideration is given in the interview process for the candidate's rating in the application screening process. In other words, the committee cannot give candidates points in the interview phase for their application presentation and content.

#### 1. Preliminary:

- The committee should have a copy of the job announcement and a copy of the interview questions for the candidate to refer to, if necessary.
- Welcome the candidate and thank him/her for his/her interest in employment with the District. The
  committee members should introduce themselves. In some cases it may also be helpful to have
  name plates for each committee member.
- Explain the interview process: Such as how the questions will be asked, indicate the committee
  will be taking notes and may not have direct eye contact but to feel assured the committee is
  listening carefully to everything being said.
- Point out he/she may refer to the interview questions at any time during the interview.
- Point out he/she will have an opportunity at the end of the interview to ask questions.

#### 2. Interviews:

Note: Candidates may have jotted down notes when previewing the interview questions. Do not be alarmed as this is acceptable. However, please retrieve these notes before they leave the interview. This excludes any handouts provided for the teaching demonstration, which may include lesson plans, etc.

Now that the preliminary procedures are completed, the committee may conduct the interviews assuring every applicant is asked the same questions.

If interviews are conducted on more than one day, the committee chair is responsible for retrieving the interview screening forms from the committee members and keeping them in a secure location until the interviews resume.

After each interview, the committee is encouraged not to discuss the candidates. This dialogue can be perceived as a mechanism to insert individual biases about candidates into the process. Each committee member has the responsibility to evaluate each candidate from his / her own perspective and not to be influenced by others. Everyone will have an opportunity to discuss the candidates during the deliberation process.

Every committee member must complete an interview form for each candidate. Committee members are encouraged to keep job-related notes on the candidate's responses. If committee members do not keep notes on the interview form and use other paper, the document must be attached to the interview form and submitted to the committee chair at the appropriate time. In the event of any challenge to the committee's process, the committee member may have to provide specific points as to why members gave one candidate a 5 rating and another candidate a 2 rating. After a long period of time, it is unlikely that committee members will remember every detail and the committee's process could be suspect.

At the close of the interviews, give the candidates an opportunity to ask questions.

If a candidate wants to give the committee documentation during or after the interview (with the exception of lesson plans for the teaching demonstration) that was not requested by the committee in advance to all candidates, the committee can respond in one of two ways: Accept the information and say thank you or tell the candidate, in fairness to all candidates, such documents cannot be accepted. If the committee accepts the information, the committee chair is to keep the information in his/her possession and it is not to be shared with committee members or used in the deliberation process.

Teaching demonstration: The committee may accept documents given to it that are specifically related to the teaching demonstration, such as a lesson plan. This does not include former student evaluations or the candidate's personal philosophy of education.

Candidates may ask when a selection is to be made, etc. Do not give specific dates. Tell them that if they are selected for a second interview, they will be notified verbally. Candidates not selected for a second interview will be notified by Human Resources.

#### **Important Note:**

• The committee members may not duplicate the interview forms or any attached documentation for their records. These documents are confidential District records.

Questions from candidates after the interview is complete:

Refer all calls to Human Resources. Do not discuss a candidate's interview with anyone, not even the candidate.

#### Deliberations:

The committee may follow the same process outlined in SECTION 10, which includes the committee chair tabulating the committee composite scores from interviews.

The committee may choose an alternative method in a joint meeting as follows:

- Each committee member shall rank candidates in order from their highest scoring to lowest scoring. There can be no ties.
- The committee chair shall tabulate the committee composite of ranking scores, indicating the candidate with lowest composite rank score is ranked first, and so on.
- The committee must decide, based upon this ranking, how many candidates the committee is forwarding as finalists.

Whatever process the committee uses, the candidates should be discussed. The strengths and weaknesses of the finalists must be developed.

The deliberation process is very important. The committee will be selecting finalists who meet all of the interview criteria. The dialogue must be job-related and there must be no discussion about race, gender, cultures, or disabilities of the candidates. The goal is to hire the best qualified person who meets all of the pre-determined interview criteria, which include sensitivity to the diversity of our students. If he / she has strong knowledge in the subject matter but could not give specific examples of multiple teaching methods and demonstrate problem-solving skills, then this is not the person we should select.

After deliberations, the chair enters the scores on to the First-level Interviews Composite Ranking form.

#### 4. Finalists:

In selecting candidates for a finalist interview, the committee sends a message to the hiring manager that any of the candidates are qualified and would contribute to the overall effectiveness of the college and the District. If possible, the recommended candidates for the second interview should have consensus of the committee. However, consensus may not be achieved. If this is the case, a majority of the committee may forward recommended candidates. A committee member is not required to change his/her points for a candidate in order to reflect the decision of the committee.

Caution: The recommended finalists should mirror the ranking of the candidates as a result of the interview. If this does not occur, there is a cause for concern and the process may appear suspect. If there is conflict between the committee members, contact Human Resources.

#### **SECTION 13: Recommendation of Finalists**

Next, the committee must complete the Recommendation of Finalists form. Use this form to list the finalists in alphabetical order, by last name, and summarize their strengths and weaknesses.

Complete this form, and submit it, along with the First-level Interviews Composite Ranking form and ALL first-level interview materials, to Human Resources.

The Human Resources Department shall review all documentation, certify the process, and forward a copy of the Recommendation of Finalists to the hiring manager.

The Human Resources Department will notify the non-selected applicants from the first interview.

#### **SECTION 14: Finalist Interviews**

The finalists' interviews are conducted by the President or designee for all full-time faculty positions.

The search committee chair or designee shall sit on the finalists' interviews and participate with the President to recommend a candidate. Others may be invited as appropriate.

Unlike the initial interviews, the final interviewers have more flexibility in the questions that may be asked of each candidate. However, the finalist interviews are still governed by the same EEO laws and restrictions. As with the initial interviews, all notes and other printed materials used during the final interview will be collected and submitted to Human Resources.

The finalist interview process may also include a tour of the campus, open forums, or presentations.

The President's Office is responsible for making all arrangements for scheduling the finalists' interviews. The finalists may not preview the interview questions.

Finalists traveling more than 400 miles may receive limited reimbursement for authorized travel expenses. To be reimbursed, the finalists must submit the Request for Candidate Reimbursement—Finalist Interviews form and the original receipts directly to the Human Resources Department for processing. Please contact the HR Specialist for more information.

After the interviews, the President shall consult with the faculty search committee chair and, in the President's discretion, others involved on the interview panel, and make the hiring decision.

#### **SECTION 15: Reference Checks**

The purpose of reference checking is to confirm the information obtained in the interview, to confirm information submitted on the employment application, and to ensure the selected person is the right person for the job. The reference check process should be taken seriously and completed as thoroughly as possible in the event the District and the committee members are subjected to accusations of negligent hiring.

#### A. Reference Check Component

There are two components to the reference checking process: one is completed by the committee and the other is completed by Human Resources. The committee assesses the candidate's knowledge, skills and abilities and Human Resources evaluates legal implications of the "general questions" section of the employment application. The committee shall not, in the paper screening, interview or reference checking processes, disqualify or evaluate a candidate based on responses to these questions. Sometimes, candidates make mistakes in their answers or the legal implications have no negative impact on employment. If there is a cause for concern after Human Resources completes its responsibility in legal compliance, the college President or Vice President will be contacted.

# B. Reference Checking Period

The goal is to assess the candidate's work history and work ethic during the last five years. If he/she has not worked during this period, find out what the candidate has done during the last five years, if not indicated on the application. The committee may have to go beyond the last five years to obtain two references. Reference checks MUST be completed.

#### C. Responsibility for Checking References

Reference checking may be completed by the hiring manager or the committee chair. However, there are basic rules to follow:

- 1. All questions must be asked of each reference for each finalist; do not skip over questions, ask them all. Do not add questions.
- 2. If several people are involved in the process, one person must call all references for one finalist. Do not split up reference checks for each candidate as at least one committee member must see all references for the finalist.
- 3. A minimum of two references are required from current and former supervisors.
  - a. A reference check for an internal candidate (i.e., associate instructor) with at least the current supervisor is required unless the current supervisor and hiring manager is the same person. The hiring manager may not serve as a reference. If the current supervisor is also the hiring manager, then a reference check from another source is required, preferably from a previous supervisor. If, in this case, the committee member is unable to obtain a reference from a previous supervisor, it must be explained.
- 4. If the committee member is unable to reach a reference after trying several times, the reference checking form should be completed and a notation made.
- 5. If the committee member contacts a reference and the reference refuses to give one, the reference checking form should be completed and a notation made. This should be explored; it may be a red flag.
- 6. Include all comments, both positive and negative; we must obtain a balanced reference.
- 7. If the committee member receives a negative reference, conduct more than two references to assure a thorough reference.
- 8. Submit all completed successful and unsuccessful reference checking forms.

# D. Reference Checking Steps

- Review the Reference Release section located on the employment application-and follow the
  directions of the finalist. The finalist has either provided a release to contact all and current
  supervisors or to notify him/her first before contacting references. If the finalist has selected the
  latter, notify the finalist and indicate that the committee is in the next phase of the selection
  process and the committee is going to begin calling references.
- 2. If the finalist continues to request that his/her current supervisor not be contacted, then consult with Human Resources.
- 3. Call two supervisory references located in the "Experience" section of the employment application. In some cases, the finalist has not worked at three different organizations. For example, the committee may have to contact former master teachers where they interned or worked part-time in college, or contact a person where they volunteered, etc. The committee member may have to become creative in obtaining references.
- 4. If the finalist does not provide names and phone numbers of supervisors, contact the finalist to let him/her know the committee is completing the next phase of the selection process and is going to call references, so names, titles and phone numbers of current and former supervisors are needed.
- 5. Character references cannot replace supervisor references when there are current and former supervisors listed in the "Experience" section.

- 6. In some situations, the supervisor is deceased, no longer working at the business, or the business is defunct. In these cases, the committee member may have to speak to another colleague or another supervisor who knows of the finalist and his/her work ethic.
- 7. It is acceptable to obtain references via email and FAX. If one of these options is selected, send the reference a copy of the reference check form because we want the reference to answer the same questions as any other reference. For example, it is not acceptable to simply email a statement concerning the finalist.
- 8. Document employment history, obtain the name, job title, and name of the organization of the reference. Compare this information to the work history provided in the employment application. Is it the same? Clarify, if necessary.
- 9. Do not expect to complete the reference checking in one day; it may take several days to complete a <u>thorough</u> reference check for a finalist.
- 10. If the committee member is having difficulty in obtaining a thorough reference check or has questions or concerns, please contact Human Resources for assistance.

#### **SECTION 16: Job Offer**

The President, or designee, shall inform Human Resources of the recommended candidate for hire, and submit the completed reference checks and finalist interview materials.

Only the staff in the Human Resources Department may make an official job offer. Prior to making a job offer, the Human Resources Department will perform the following steps:

- Review the names of the committee members and confirm submission of interview rating forms for the first and finalists interviews. Assure there are rating forms for all committee members, rating forms are totaled and forms are signed.
- Review reference check process to ensure an adequate reference checking process has been conducted. Review responses to questions and assess responses. May follow-up with recommending parties to assure the references were reviewed and the responses have been evaluated.
- Reaffirm the candidate meets the minimum qualifications and / or equivalent qualifications.
   Ensure any equivalency documentation has been completed appropriately. If candidate was recommended based on a California Community College Credential, the credential will be reviewed to determine if it is valid and in the appropriate discipline.
- Reaffirm required college degrees are from accredited institutions.
- Review "general questions" section and follow-up, if necessary. May need to contact candidate
  regarding his/her responses. If there is a problem that would impact the selection, the Associate
  Vice Chancellor of Human Resources will contact the hiring manager.

The Human Resources Department will make the job offer contingent upon Board approval and determine if any ADA accommodation is required. If the finalist accepts, Human Resources will notify the President and the committee chair. The Human Resources Department will contact the other finalists to inform them a selection has been made.

# **SECTION 17: Appointment**

The Human Resources Department will prepare the Board of Trustees agenda item and notify the finalist of the contingent offer. After Board approval, Human Resources will notify the finalist to confirm the appointment.

IMPORTANT NOTE: At each stage of the hiring process—selection of candidates for interviews, selection of candidates for second level interviews, and hiring, the candidate pool will be reviewed by Human Resources to ensure compliance with equal employment opportunity provisions.

Reviewed and recommended for approval by West Valley College Academic Senate March 10, 2020. Reviewed and recommended for approval by Mission College Academic Senate March 26, 2020. Reviewed by District Council November 6, 2017.